

Cataloging & Classification Quarterly

REFEREE'S CHECKLIST

The following checklist is intended to be suggestive only; it is neither inclusive nor exclusive, and you should feel free to introduce other criteria as they may apply. Each paper should be evaluated on its own merits.

SCOPE OF JOURNAL

Is the paper genuinely in the fields of cataloging or classification, broadly defined? It should also be something more than a simple description of how we do it good at our place, although this type of article should not be precluded when it has wider implications or adds information about a type of library or geographic area under-represented in the literature. Would it be better in another journal?

CONTENT

If information, is it actually informative? If based on research, is the research sound? If opinion, is it well thought out?

If "new," is it actually new? If it is a review presentation, are the relevant sources considered? Is it an original contribution to the field?

Is it accurate? Adequately documented? Complete within the author's own terms?

Is it balanced? Is opinion distinguished from fact? If a paper is biased or takes an unconventional approach, these are quite acceptable if clearly evident and well presented.

Is the topic adequately analyzed and interpreted?

PRESENTATION

Is it written in a clear, readable style? The paper can be copy-edited, but only the author can re-write it.

Technical and professional terminology is fine, but is it free of jargon?

Is it well organized? This may not mean a formal outline, but there should be a beginning, a middle and an end, with a logical progression of acts and thought.

Should the author be asked to add (or delete) illustrative matter (charts, tables, etc.)?

VALUE

Is this a useful contribution to the literature? It may not be a masterpiece or a landmark article, but it shouldn't be ephemeral or superficial. Watch for the article which seems to be simply an effort to publish for academic status or tenure.

Would you publish the article if you were responsible for CCQ?